

Balochistan Livelihood & Entrepreneurship Project (BLEP)

TERMS OF REFERENCE (Third Party Monitoring & Verification -TPM&V-Firm)

1. Introduction:

The province of Balochistan has been hosting refugees since the late 1970s. According to a study by ILO and UNHCR, almost 23 percent of Afghan refugees (according to UNHCR, approximately 318,000) in Pakistan are concentrated in six districts in Northern Balochistan. Refugees were initially placed in special villages, they have been relatively free to move out to urban areas since the mid-1990s, when refugee villages were abandoned. Moreover, refugees are able to access to national social services by Pakistani authorities to meet educational and health requirements. Finally, as per a 1997 circular issued by the Ministry of Interior, Afghan refugees are legally authorized to seek employment in Pakistan. The PoR cards, issued by GoP since 2006 to provide proof of legal residence and status to Afghan refugees, have contributed to this end.

The double burden on resources has affected development outcomes for refugees and host communities in Balochistan. Even-though the country has witnessed average growth rates of 4 percent in the past decade, these have not led to commensurate growth in the province for four main reasons. **First**, population density in the province is low, at 38 persons per square kilometer which falls to 15 in the rural areas. Given the scattered nature of settlements in Balochistan, this implies negligible and cost-ineffective service delivery. **Second**, resource mobilization at the grassroots level is particularly constrained and this is exacerbated by, amongst others, lack of skills and training, low awareness regarding market opportunities, limited access to finance and high cost of doing businesses. Resource mobilization capacity of the province is restricted given the low tax base. **Third**, like most traditional and rural societies, even in Balochistan there is a dominance of consumption expenditure and the emphasis on savings for investment purposes is limited. **Fourth**, weak capacity and a dearth of qualified human resources in Balochistan hinders service delivery to the poor.

Gender disparities in Balochistan are high across the board. There is a gap between access to economic opportunities and productive resources. Cultural norms do not favor female employment in productive and income generating activities and although the trend is changing, women largely remain unpaid family workers. Cultural norms determine perceptions towards women's engagement in productive and income generating activities. Women have a lack of skills training: in the eight districts surveyed, on average, 85.1 percent of the households surveyed reported a male member receiving training while only 14.9 percent of the households reported a female member having received training. Female access to productive resources including financial capital is also restricted, which ends up being a critical entry barrier for enterprise development. Even-though the province has a rich tradition of social mobilization and community organisations have generated significant amounts of savings, these resources are 'communal' to be used for the creation of public goods and not to support individual entrepreneurs for the promotion of livelihoods. Unlike in other parts of the country, the idea of using these resources for the purposes of revolving credit at the community level is not common in Balochistan.

2. Project Description:

The Balochistan Livelihoods and Enterprenaureship Project (BLEP) is comprised of three components; that are briefly described with proposed activities here below:

Component 1: (Economic Mobilization)

The objective of this component is to support both the refugees and host communities in rural and peri-urban areas of selected districts in Balochistan to collectively access technical and financial resources while converting location disadvantage into location advantage, thereby addressing issues related to low population density and high cost of delivery in an inclusive manner. **This component has two sub-components, including community facilitation and citizens engagement.** The first sub-component will leverage existing social capital to identify those entrepreneurs who can become potential project beneficiaries and create a cadre of Local Facilitators (LFs) and Technical Resources Persons (TRPs) who will be remunerated based on deliverables and will support the Project Management and Implementation Unit (PMIU) in project implementation. While LFs will provide communities with overall support, the TRPs will provide specialized business development support to entrepreneurs supported through the project.

The **Citizens' Engagement strategy to be developed and rolled out** as part of Component 1 will be context-based and will seek to mainly change community perceptions regarding savings and investments and also promote inclusive enterprise development, focusing particularly on women, youth and refugees. The aim of the strategy will be to develop adequate methods of citizens' engagement given the intra and inter district diversity within Balochistan.

Component 2. Promoting Enterprise Development and Livelihoods

This component will support **local entrepreneurs and individuals** to enhance profitability and income through the provision of matching grants, business development support and vocational training. **This component has three sub-components.** The first sub component, **Enterprise facilitation** is aimed at supporting groups of entrepreneurs and individual entrepreneurs having common economic interests and individual entrepreneurs to prepare Enterprise Development Plans (EDPs), which will broadly outline requirements for Business Development Services (BDS), issues related to access to finance, skills gap, market linkages and the need for Business Support Facilities (BSFs). These will be funded through the project. The **second sub-component will support individuals engaged in subsistence activities** in the development and implementation of **Livelihoods Investment Plans (LIPs)**. This sub-component will help the beneficiaries of LIPs to graduate from subsistence towards more structured and semi-formal economic activities. The **third sub-component** is aimed at **developing a vocational training and skills programme** in rural parts of Balochistan to not only improve employability of individuals but also to create a skilled workforce that can be utilized by the enterprises supported through provision of matching grants.

Given the legal status of refugees in Pakistan and their inability to legally own immovable assets, the activities proposed in the first two sub-components will be targeted to host communities while **technical and vocational training will be targeted to both host communities and refugees.** At the community level, refugees who will be trained through the project, can be employed by the enterprises that are being supported by the project in the same locality. Also, refugees who are beneficiaries of trainings can be provided with small movable assets to become self-employed. This link will be facilitated by the Local facilitators and technical resource persons at the community level.

Component 3. Project Management

This component will develop the institutional capacity of the Planning and Development Department (P&DD), Government of Balochistan, to implement the Project. By addressing low public-sector capacity, the Project will increase transparency and efficiency.

Project Beneficiaries:

The project will benefit an estimated 56,610 households directly of which 8,615 are expected to be refugees. The project will target host communities and refugees based in geographical areas affected by a PRS. **The project will target three groups** of direct beneficiaries. The **first group** of beneficiaries will comprise of entrepreneurs, organized as Enterprise Clusters (ECs), selected through the facilitation of the CBPs, who are engaged in common economic interests (not necessarily the same businesses). These groups will be supported under component 2, post development of comprehensive EDPs, covering financial and non-financial constraints for business growth. **The second type of beneficiaries** that will be identified through the project are individual entrepreneurs, who require financial capital and/or non-financial support to grow their individual business. These individuals will also be required to prepare EDPs to determine financial and/or support to be provided by the project. **Finally, the project will support** the livelihoods of those individuals with micro/subsistence level of incomes. These beneficiaries are expected to prepare LIPs, which will identify some immediate needs that will require support for improving their livelihoods. It is anticipated that a significant number of LIPs will be prepared by women, particularly given their involvement in the handicrafts sector and food processing. While the first two groups comprise opportunity entrepreneurs, the third group comprises necessity entrepreneurs.

Project Area:

The project will be implemented in eight districts, namely Zhob, Chagai, Nushki, Sherani, Killa Saifullah, Killa Abdullah, Pishin and Mastung, five of which have been affected by prolonged refugee presence. Poverty rates in these districts are high from the outset and the presence of refugees for almost 40 years has placed an unsustainable strain on resources.

3. Objective of the Current Consultancy

Planning and Development department through Project Management & Implementation Unit (PMIU) being implementing agency of the project intends to hire a third party Monitoring & Verification (TPM&V) firm to **conduct Operational Review** of project activities to have regular feedback on **Targeting, Communication, Grant Payments; its utilization, Mobilization, Grievance Redress, Processes and impact Evaluation** in implementing such activities. Through the Operational Review, the firm shall ensure checks and feedback on all implementing partners and district teams of the Program and contribute in maximizing the quality of outputs, outcomes and Impact; as PMIU will continuously improve the processes on the basis of feedback received from the firm through such Operational Reviews. Similarly the firm will also be responsible to conduct verification process for all activities under the project.

The TPM&V firm will carry operational review that will comprise of two key components¹ i.e. **1. Spot Checks & 2. Process Evaluation.**

¹ Refer to Section 4 for proposed design features of these key components

1. Spot Checks: will be representative at the overall (program) at district level, covering all the variations of universe of research, with enough confidence to generalize the findings. This shall include the sample based spot checks for Community Institutions/Community Interest Groups regarding their formation, payments of grants to individuals through Livelihood Implementation Plans (LIPs), Entrepreneurship Development Plans (EDPs) and Business Development Facility (BDF), its utilization and process evaluations. The firm have to check the skill and vocational training component as well by considering the selection process adopted and its verification. In addition to above Spot Checks, the firm will also conduct beneficiary surveys focused on delivery of the program. The spot check survey is expected to be a merger of quantitative, qualitative and analytical exercise.

2. Process Evaluation: Process evaluation is the most needed exercise. It will include a detailed review of PMIU processes and operational activities. The comparison of prescribed processes and practices will indicate the shortcomings, deviations and lacunas at operational end. Together the results of spot checks and process evaluation will link the shortcomings with design & implementation and hence suggest remedies to the prevailing problems. The Process Evaluation methodology will include visits to the communities and grant takers/ grant payments as well as an examination of grievance status. These activities will be conducted using a range of techniques which will include direct observation, interviews with key staff of implementing agencies, beneficiary feedback for the assessment of satisfaction, analysis of the performance in districts wrt population.

4. Design of Operational Review:

In consultation with BLEP PMIU, The design should also be robust enough of effectively using the qualitative information in analysis. The overall approach should not only based on strong assumptions, rather a learning approach will be appreciated, to effectively trace trends in key areas of interest.

The '*Universe*' of the Spot Checks will be the overall sampling space of BLEP beneficiaries. The spot checks will be focusing on but not limited to following areas;

- a) **CIs/ CIGs registration**
- b) **Grant Payments and its utilization**
- c) **Grievances**
- d) **Trainings**

With a representation of all BLEP beneficiaries, the Spot Checks will be based on a survey cycle, which will systematically select sample from reactivation/ to payments utilization. In addition to above this will also include beneficiary survey to measure the performance at end nodes. The exercise will have two parts;

- I. Focus on Deliverables (Observing resultants at end nodes- Beneficiary focused)
- II. Focus on Processes (Observation of BLEP operational activities against design)

Activity at I (Focus on Deliverables) will be further divided into two sub activities i.e. the qualitative approach and quantitative approach. The second part (focus on processes) will be based on detailed examination of manuals and their implementation at operational level. The detailed design of Spot Checks will be devised and finalised in consultation with BLEP.

A statistically significant sample representative at Program level covering all the possible strata. The first survey data may also provide the base for sensitivity analysis and the result may help in adjusting the design, sample size and tools as well. The tools for both qualitative and quantitative parts of the exercise will be designed in consultation with HoP & M&E (BLEP). The overall design will be a living model and may incorporate changes based on requirements and suggestions of BLEP.

CI/CIG Registration:

The monitoring visits will be carried out and reported on quarterly basis. This may includes; (i) Community Institutions and Community Institutions groups are properly formed as per ops manual criteria. (ii) Proper meetings are carried out during the life cycle of project; and (iii) Documents and meeting minutes properly maintained by the communities.

Grant payment and its utilization:

The frequency of the Grant payments will be on quarterly feedback. The grant spot checks will provide a true picture of disbursements outreach to intended beneficiaries and its proper utilization as per project objectives. Grant spot checks will also provide evidence on the efficiency, transparency and legitimacy of the payment procedures.

Grievance :

Grievance Spot Checks will be carried out bi-annually, the grievance spot checks will have a detailed analysis of Grievance Redress Process from observation at end nodes and within the process and provide an analysis & suggest the solution. These spot checks will focus on the measure of awareness of GR process among beneficiaries (complainants), their experience with the process, transparency, efficacy and effectiveness and additionally the attitude of staff (BLEP). This exercise will not only help in making course corrections in design of GR process but also provide management an opportunity for enhancement of transparency. This exercise will help determine how accurately the guidelines specified in the Operations Manual regarding grievance and case management, are being followed. The team should seek information on various issues including delays, behavior of staff (BLEP), charging for services, refusal to accept/process grievance and alleged corruption. The team should also assess the performance and efficiency of the MIS developed by the BLEP team for grievance.

Trainings:

Spot checks for the trainings will be carried out and reported on Quarterly basis. This will help the project that trainings are accordance with need of the beneficiaries and may suggest further trainings as required by the participants.

5. Design of Process Evaluation:

This shall include, but not limited to the following sections; (i) basic Informations; (ii) physical observations; (iii) interviews with key staff in all districts; (iv) interviews with beneficiaries in districts; (v) noting key issues and (vi) a pictorial record.

The Consultant will observe activities at district level and will include an assessment of the management and internal communications, monitoring and quality control of the processes.

The Consultant's Proposal shall include initial ideas as to how the sampling will be handled and this will subsequently be presented in detail in the Inception Report. The main features of the operations

for grants includes Targeting, Enrolment, Verification, Payments, Communication, Beneficiary Engagement and Outreach, and Monitoring and Evaluation.

The verification of the different activities will be conducted by the TPM&V firm and will report on quarterly, considering the following steps as under;

1. Implementation of Livelihood Implementation Plan:

In this activity the firm will be acting as third-party monitoring and verification and shall perform the tasks that include but not limited to the following:

- a. Verification of livelihood beneficiaries are as per selection criteria.
- b. The inputs provided in shape of grants are in accordance with Quality and Quantity?
- c. Whether utilization of the said interventions is according to their need and projects objectives.
- d. Current status of intervention and its impact.

2. Enterprise Development Plan:

Similarly in this activity the firm will be acting as third-party monitoring and verification and shall perform the tasks that include but not limited to the following:

- a. Verification of Enterprise development beneficiaries are as per selection criteria
- b. Enterprise development plan is properly developed and feasible.
- c. Verification of beneficiary contribution towards ED cost.
- d. The inputs provided in shape of grants are in accordance with Quality and Quantity?
- e. Current status of intervention and its impact.

3. Business Support Facility:

In this activity the firm will be acting as third-party monitoring and verification and shall perform the tasks that include but not limited to the following:

- a. Verification of beneficiaries as per selection criteria
- b. Is Business Plan is suitable and viable for the Target Area?
- c. Verification of beneficiary contribution towards BSF cost.
- d. The inputs provided in shape of grants are in accordance with Quality and Quantity?
- e. Current status of intervention and its impact.

4. Skill & Vocational Trainings:

In this activity the firm will be acting as third-party monitoring and verification and shall perform the tasks that include but not limited to the following:

- a. Beneficiary selection accordance with set criteria
- b. Whether trainings are in line with their needs?
- c. Beneficiaries trained by proper professionals/Institutes
- d. Are the beneficiaries taking benefit or utilizing their skills by acquiring these trainings
- e. Whether the project linked the beneficiaries in hunting the jobs after the trainings

6. Duration of Assignment

The assignment should be completed within two years from the day of contract signing. The assignment is extendable on prescribed rule of WB procurement guidelines, The payment spot checks will be carried out on each quarter whereas the grievance spot checks will be conducted on bi annual frequency. The process evaluation/impact will also be a bi-annual activity. While verification would be done and reported on quarterly basis.

7. Methodology

The contracted firm is expected to prepare appropriate methodology using a variety of quantitative and qualitative approaches to meet the objectives of the study. The methodology and relevant tools should be developed in consultation with PMIU (M&E) BLEP.

8. **Specific Tasks:** The specific tasks of the firm shall include but not limited to the following:

8.1 Hiring of staff

The Consultant shall ensure that they recruit / hire an adequate number of field staff but not limited to staff mentioned in Annexure 1 with appropriate qualifications and experience which should be commensurate with the complexity of the exercise and the need for accurate monitoring and observation.

8.2 Training of all Consultant Staff involved in the Operational Audit

The firm will train the Consultant's key staff in line with the Operational Manual and other key Project Documents. These key staff would be the 'Master Trainers' and would then conduct further training sessions for the Operational Review field staff in accordance with the provisions of the Operations Manual, these Terms of Reference and the consultant's Inception Report. Additional specific training may be required for the Audit of enrolment, grant disbursements and grievance procedures at household level. The Consultant shall ensure that each and every person who has to take part in the exercise is properly trained and clearly understands all the concepts.

8.3 Dialogue with BLEP Management.

The M&V firm is expected to be in continuous dialogue with PMIU, BLEP to:

- Identify key areas of interest for overall exercise (including tools preparation)
- Agree sampling, design & methodology, variables to be observed; and
- Ensure quality of all phases of the exercise.

The design of the research, methodology, sampling, representativeness of the sample, data collection, documentation (data entry & consolidation) analysis and report writing for overall exercise shall be done in consultation & agreement with M&E of PMIU, BLEP.

8.4 Beneficiary Survey:

The survey will examine the beneficiary experience in detail, on a sample basis, to provide a quantifiable assessment of performance. Through this detailed survey, the consultant will closely follow up, on a sample basis, the activities as experienced by the beneficiaries e.g. beneficiary communications, social mobilization, enrolment, grant payments & its proper utilization and grievance procedures. The survey will provide some quantification of how accurate the

implementation has been from the beneficiary's perspective with respect to the agreed Operational Manual.

Variety of tools would be used to evaluate the implementation of the operational standards laid out in the Operational Manual and guidelines. These tools might include, but would not be restricted to, direct observation, interviews, questionnaires, focus group discussions, data collection (Primary and Secondary) etc. Shadowing of various activities of the operational cycle would also be done for the same purpose.

a. Survey (Quantitative) Key Activities:

- (ii) Define the survey respondents and the sampling frames for survey;
- (iii) Estimate the required sample size (at 95% confidence level, + - 5% margin of error)
- (iv) Design questionnaires for each survey, pre-test and finalize;
- (v) Prepare data analysis plan and encoding instruction;
- (vi) Orient enumerators and field supervisors on survey questionnaires and conduct field work doing face-to-face interview using the questionnaires;
- (vii) Check collected questionnaires for clarity and completeness and encode into the data base using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) software;
- (viii) Generate tables based on the analysis plan and analyze.

a. Beneficiary Feedback (Qualitative):

The qualitative survey will be consisting of the following;

- Focused Group Discussions
- Community Dialogue (with community leaders and notables)
- Secondary data analysis

The firm will be expected to perform following:

- (i) Prepare plan to conduct FGDs / interviews to complement quantitative surveys, as follows:
- (ii) Prepare FGD guide questions for participants.
- (iii) Organize logistics and conduct FGDs
- (iv) Prepare qualitative reports.

8.5 Data Entry (Digitization).

Collected information should be digitized and a converged MIS database will be maintained. The final output should be an SPSS or STATA file, with variables clearly labeled. The raw and cleaned data (data set for analysis) should be immediately (as soon as the data collection and entry is finished) available to the BLEP.

8.6 Field Operations

A field procedure plan should be developed and outline in detail all aspects of the field work to be conducted by the survey firm, including:

- Composition of a standard field survey team
 - Number of enumerators
 - Number of field-supervisors
 - Number of field data entry agents
 - Qualifications, training
- Expected tasks and responsibilities of each member of the team
- Number of visits per household
- Detailed calendar of activities
- The expected time each team will spend in a union Council
- Travel and lodging logistics
- Management information/reporting tools for tracking progress of survey
- Protocols for confirming:
 - The Treatment/Control status of the cluster
 - Confirmation that the location has been correctly identified
- Supervision and spot check plans to ensure adherence to data collection protocols and confirm quality of data collection and entry
- Protocols and procedures for addressing data inconsistencies/miss-reporting when identified
- Paper questionnaire and data transmission protocols

8.7 Key Considerations for Specific Task

- Submission of an inception report which will outline in detail the sampling and data collection methodology (to include key variables for which data will be collected) and spot check, Citizens Engagement & Process Evaluation methodology developed in light of discussions with PMIU, BLEP.
- The firm will be provided with beneficiary lists with full details on address, household head name, location, in order for maximum coverage and to determine a representative sample for the spot check exercise. The firm should also consider picking cases (particularly on grievances) from the MIS. Household listing exercise may be done in sampling units for final sample selection (if required).
- Level of sample representation needs to be decided i.e. district wise in comparison to total population residing in each identified/selected district. When proposing the sampling methodology; the firm must provide evidence for a statistically significant and representative sample of prospect beneficiaries of the program. A justification for the agreed percentage of households to be surveyed via a door-to-door approach must be provided in the inception report. This shall include impact of geographical locations on program components and its repercussions.
- Data will be collected through face to face interviews and focus group discussions (quantitative and qualitative). Discussions will involve a focus on receiving timely grants and its desired and effective utilization in line with the program design.
- The firm will develop spot check instruments and finalize after an in-depth discussions with M&E BLEP and will carry out pre-test in the field before being finalized
- Firm to submit the report (deliverable) to PMIU and after thorough review by M&E the payments to be released.
- A detailed logistics and work plan with details on all field visits (number, location etc) should be annexed with the inception report.
- Monitoring of all key steps involved during roll out and subsequent implementation of FOUR key activities (Entrepreneurs grants through EDP, Livelihood grants through LIP, Business

Development Facilities and Vocational & Skill and Vocational trainings) of the program from inception. .

Also, nature of business proposed/opted by beneficiaries and expected outcome based on current market environment and business intervention

9. Confidentialities and Data Ownership:

The survey instruments, the sampling, and the information gathered by the field workers cannot be used for personal or professional goals by the local consultant firm, field workers or the coordinator and advisor without the prior request and an approval by the BLEP management. The ownership of the data belongs to the BLEP. The raw and cleaned data should be available immediately after the data is collected. Any delay in this matter will affect the payments to the survey firm.

10. Qualification Criteria for :

- i. Firm must be registered as Active tax payer in FBR and Board of Revenue.
- ii. A Consultancy Firm must have overall working experience of at least ten (10) years.
- iii. A firm must have related working experience of five years (*contract duration of assignments*) of similar to the required scope of Services by utilizing M&E indicators, data analysis, statistical and research, monitoring, verification & evaluation expertise, tools and systems measuring target achievements.
- iv. A firm must have working experience of at least two M&E/TPV projects in public sector organizations. (Letter of awards, contracts, and Completion certificates should be attached with EOI)
- v. Firm must provide list of required key experts (Annexure I)
(*CVs are not required at this stage*).

11. Selection Method

Firms will be selected as per Least Cost Based Selection (LCS) Method in accordance with the World Bank Procurement Regulations of Goods, Works, Non-Consulting and Consulting Services July 2016 Revised November 2017 and August 2018.

12. Key Deliverables

Key Deliverables		
Name	Frequency	Timelines
Inception Report	Once	Within first month, after signing off the contract
Grants Spot Checks Report	Quarterly	Before the end of each quarter Should be within 15 days after each Quarter.
Grievance Spot Checks Report	Bi-Annually	Within one month after two quarters (quarters of FY)
Process Evaluation Report	Quarterly	Before the end of each quarter Should be within 15 days after each Quarter. The report will cover all TPM&V activities, appropriated as described in the TORs
Beneficiary Feedback Survey (Quantitative)	Bi-Annually	Within one month after two quarters (quarters of FY)
Beneficiary Feedback (Qualitative)	Bi-Annually	Within one month after two quarters (quarters of FY)
Interventions Verification Reports	Bi-Annually	Within one month after two quarters (quarters of FY). The report will cover all the verification activities performed as per TORs

13. Required Key Experts

Annexure I

Key Experts	Qty	Qualification
Team Leader	1	Sixteen years of education in social sciences with at least 20 years of working experience in M&E Assignments and at least 10 years of working experience as a team leader.
Deputy TL/Report compiler	1	Sixteen years of education in social sciences with at least 15 years of working experience in M&E Assignments and at least 05 years of working experience as a Deputy TL/Report compiler.
District Coordinators	8	Fourteen years of education in social sciences with at least 10 years of working experience in M&E Assignments and at least three (03) years' relevant working experience.
Data enumerators	24	Fourteen years of education in social sciences with at least 05 years relevant working experience
Data Entry Officer	1	Twelve years of education in any discipline with at least 05 years relevant working experience.
Support Staff	3	Matriculate